

Request for ADA accommodations should be made at least three business days before the meeting and directed to: JCCAccessCoordinator@jud.ca.gov

TRIBAL COURT-STATE COURT FORUM

NOTICE AND AGENDA OF OPEN MEETING

Open to the Public (Cal. Rules of Court, rule 10.75(c)(1) and (e)(1))

THIS MEETING IS BEING CONDUCTED BY ELECTRONIC MEANS

THIS MEETING IS BEING RECORDED

 Date:
 December 8, 2022

 Time:
 12:15 - 1:15 p.m.

Public Call-in Number: 833 568 8864 Meeting ID: 160 333 3129 (Listen Only)

Meeting materials will be posted on the advisory body web page on the California Courts website at least three business days before the meeting.

Members of the public seeking to make an audio recording of the meeting must submit a written request at least two business days before the meeting. Requests can be e-mailed to forum@jud.ca.gov.

Agenda items are numbered for identification purposes only and will not necessarily be considered in the indicated order.

I. OPEN MEETING (CAL. RULES OF COURT, RULE 10.75(c)(1))

Call to Order and Roll Call

Approval of Minutes

Approve minutes of the October 19, 2022, Tribal Court–State Court Forum meeting.

II. Public Comment (Cal. Rules of Court, Rule 10.75(K)(1))

This meeting will be conducted by electronic means with a listen only conference line available for the public. As such, the public may submit comments for this meeting only in writing. In accordance with California Rules of Court, rule 10.75(k)(1), written comments pertaining to any agenda item of a regularly noticed open meeting can be submitted up to one complete business day before the meeting. For this specific meeting, comments should be e-mailed to forum@jud.ca.gov. Only comments received by 12:15 p.m. on December 7, 2022 will be provided to advisory body members prior to the start of the meeting.

III. INFORMATION ONLY ITEMS (NO ACTION REQUIRED)

Item 1

Cochairs Report

Item 2

Rules and Forms: Discretionary Tribal Participation in Juvenile Cases Involving Tribal Children

Presenter: Ann Gilmour, Attorney, Judicial Council of California, Center for Families, Children and the Courts

Item 3

Indian Child Welfare Act (ICWA) Court Conference

Presenter: Honorable Kristina B. Lindquist, Judge of the Superior Court of California, County of Sacramento

IV. ADJOURN

Adjourn



TRIBAL COURT-STATE COURT FORUM

MINUTES OF OPEN MEETING

October 19, 2022 9:30 a.m. - 4:00 p.m.

Advisory Body Hembers Present:

Hon. Abby Abinanti, Co-chair, Hon. Joyce Hinrichs, Co-chair, Hon. April Attebury, Hon. Richard Blake, Hon. Ana España, Hon. Tara Flanagan, Mr. Christopher Haug, Hon. Winston Keh, Hon. Lawrence King, Hon. Patricia Lenzi, Hon. Devon Lomayesva, Ms. Merri Lopez-Keifer, Hon. Nicholas Mazanec, Hon. Dorothy McLaughlin, Hon. April Olson, Hon. Stephen Place, Hon. Mark Ralphs, Hon. Victorio Shaw, Ms. Christina Snider, Hon. Dean Stout, Hon. Alison Tucher, Hon.

Christine Williams, Ms. Stephanie Weldon,

Advisory Body Members Absent: Hon. Leonard Edwards (Ret.), Hon. Joni Hiramoto, Hon. Kristina Lindquist, Hon. Andrea Pella, Hon. Delia Sharpe, Hon. Allen Sumner, Hon. Mark Vezzola, Hon.

Joseph Wiseman.

Others Present:

Ms. Mae Ackerman-Brimburg, Ms. Vida Castaneda, Ms. Audrey Fancy, Ms. Ann Gilmour, Professor. Carole Goldberg, Ms. Anne Hadreas, Hon. Katherine Lucero,

Ms. Amanda Morris.

OPEN MEETING

Call to Order and Roll Call

The co-chairs called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Approval of Minutes

The Forum approved the August 11, 2022, meeting minutes with the following correction: Correct Judge Joseph Wiseman's attendance from absent to present.

Motion to approve by Judge King, seconded by Judge Williams. Motion carried; minutes approved.

DISCUSSION AND ACTION ITEMS (ITEMS 1-5)

Item 1

Welcome and Introductions

Judges Abinanti and Hinrichs welcomed all the Forum members and introduced themselves. Forum members and staff present also introduced themselves.

Item 2

Setting the Stage for Collaboration: Looking Back and Moving Forward. The continuing relevance of the "Roadmap for Making Native America Safer" the report of the Indian Law and Order Commission

Presenter: Professor Carole Goldberg, ILOC Commissioner and Jonathan D. Varat Distinguished Professor of Law Emerita at the UCLA School of Law Professor Goldberg gave an over-view of Public Law 280 (PL-280) and its effects on tribal and state legal jurisdiction in California including a discussion of the problems that tribes and states have experienced operating under PL-280. She then discussed the work of the Indian Law and Order Commission under the Tribal Law and Order Act of 2010 with a particular emphasis on the Commission's recommendations for how states and tribes in PL-280 might work together to address some of the justice challenges created by PL-280.

Item 3

Office of Youth and Community Restoration (OCYR) and Tribal Youth

Presenter: Hon. Katherine Lucero, Director, Office of Youth and Community Restoration, Health, and Human Services Agency

Judge Lucero gave an overview of the work and mandates of the OCYR. She then discussed how the OCYR plans to collaborate with tribes and tribal courts in developing plans to identify tribal youth and ensure tribes are notified and engaged when tribal youth will be returning under County realignment plans.

Item 4

Murdered and Missing Indigenous Peoples & California Response

Presenters: Ms. Merri Lopez-Keifer, Director, Office of Native American Affairs, Office of Attorney General Rob Bonta, California Department of Justice,

Ms. Stephanie Weldon, Director, Office of Tribal Affairs, California Department of Social Services.

Hon. Lawrence King, Chief Judge of the Morongo Tribal Court, and Ms. Mae Ackerman-Brimburg, Senior Attorney, National Center for Youth Law.

Ms. Maw Ackerman-Brimburg and Judge King discussed the concept of harm reduction in relation to youth impacted by commercial sexual exploitation and how the principles of harm reduction can be incorporated into courtroom practice. They also presented on the Court Harm Education Guide & Bench Cards being developed by the CSEC Action Committee of the California Child Welfare Council. Next Ms. Merri Lopez-Keifer and Ms. Stephanie Weldon discussed the work of their respective agencies related to the issue of Murdered and Missing Indigenous People and in particular children who go missing from foster care.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

Pending approval by the advisory body on December 8, 2022.



JUDICIAL COUNCIL OF CALIFORNIA

455 Golden Gate Avenue • San Francisco, California 94102-3688 www.courts.ca.gov/policyadmin-invitationstocomment.htm

INVITATION TO COMMENT SPR23-

Title

Indian Child Welfare Act (ICWA): Standards for Discretionary Tribal Participation

Proposed Rules, Forms, Standards, or Statutes

Adopt Cal. Rules of Court, rule 5.530 (f); amend rule 5.482 (d); approve form ICWA-042 Notice of Tribal Intervention or Request for Tribal Participation in a Court Proceeding Involving a Tribal Child

Proposed by

Tribal Court–State Court Forum Hon. Abby Abinanti, Cochair Hon. Joyce Hinrichs, Cochair

Family and Juvenile Law Advisory Committee Hon. Stephanie E. Hulsey, Cochair Hon. Amy M. Pellman, Cochair

Action Requested

Review and submit comments by May 12, 2023

Proposed Effective Date

January 1, 2024

Contact

Ann Gilmour, Attorney, Center for Families, Children and the Courts, 415-865-4207 ann.gilmour@jud.ca.gov

Executive Summary and Origin

The Tribal Court – State Court Forum and the Family and Juvenile Law Advisory Committee recommend that, effective January 1, 2024, the Judicial Council adopt California Rules of Court, rule 5.530 (f), amend rule 5.482(d), and approve form ICWA-042 *Notice of Tribal Intervention or Request for Tribal Participation in a Court Proceeding Involving a Tribal Child.* These rules and form clarify the process and set standards consistent with California statutes for the exercise of discretion to permit the participation of a tribe in juvenile cases involving a child affiliated with the tribe, but where the right to participate under 25 U.S.C. §1911(c) and § 224.4 of the Welfare and Institutions Code does not apply. Although the law protects the relationship between tribes and their children beyond the scope of the Indian Child Welfare Act (ICWA) and permits

This proposal has not been approved by the Judicial Council and is not intended to represent the views of the council, its Rules Committee, or its Legislation Committee. It is circulated for comment purposes only.

tribal participation in juvenile cases, tribal leaders, and advocates report that discretion to permit their participation beyond the requirements of ICWA is inconsistent from court to court.

Background

ICWA provides certain legal rights to federally recognized Indian tribes with respect to child custody proceedings involving an Indian child which is defined as any unmarried person who is under age eighteen and is either (a) a member of an Indian tribe or (b) is eligible for membership in an Indian tribe and is the biological child of a member of an Indian tribe. California has also adopted legislation to protect the relationship of Indian children with their tribes even in situations when ICWA does not apply, such as most delinquency proceedings, to recognize the rights and interests of tribal groups in California that do not currently qualify for federal recognition and children with tribal affiliation who do not meet the definition of Indian child.

This proposal addresses three specific categories of case where ICWA may not apply, but where there may still be a right on behalf of either the tribal group or the child to some manor of tribal participation in a juvenile case: (1) cases involving Indian children who are in the juvenile court because of an act that would be a crime if it were committed by an adult or to which ICWA does not apply for some other reason; (2) cases involving unrecognized tribes; and (3) children whose parents are members of tribes and are considered part of the tribal community, but who do not meet the definition of Indian child, often referred to as "heritage cases". In each of these situations, the law recognizes a relationship between the tribe and the child and provides the court with a discretion to allow the child's tribe to participate in the proceedings.

Cases Where ICWA Does Not Apply

Indian children who are placed into foster care are entitled to all the same rights as other foster children under WIC 16001.9 and also have unique protections for their cultural and political identity as Indian children. These protections for the cultural and political rights of Indian children in foster care apply equally whether they are placed in foster care under WIC §§300, 601 or 602 (WIC 16001.9(a)), even though the ICWA does not apply to most delinquency cases. These protections include the right to:

- 1. a placement that upholds the prevailing social and cultural standards of the child's Indian community, including, but not limited to, family, social, and political ties (WIC 16001.9(a)(1));
- 2. be provided with names and contact information for representatives of the child's Indian tribe and to communicate with these individuals privately (§16001.9(a)(11));
- 3. have contact with tribal members and members of the child's Indian community consistent with the prevailing social and cultural conditions and way of life of the Indian child's tribe (§16001.9(a)(14);
- 4. engage in traditional Native American religious practices (§16001.9(a)(15));

- 5. have probation personnel who have received instruction on ICWA and on cultural competency and sensitivity relating to, and best practices for, providing adequate care to Indian children in out-of-home care (§16001.9(a)(20));
- 6. recognition of the child's political affiliation with an Indian tribe or Alaskan village, including a determination of the child's membership or citizenship in an Indian tribe or Alaskan village; to receive assistance in becoming a member of an Indian tribe or Alaskan village in which the child is eligible for membership or citizenship; to receive all benefits and privileges that flow from membership or citizenship in an Indian tribe or Alaskan village; and to be free from discrimination based on the child's political affiliation with an Indian tribe or Alaskan village (§16001.9(a)(21));
- 7. have a representative of the child's Indian tribe in attendance during hearings; (§16001.9(a)(34)); and
- 8. a case plan that includes protecting the essential tribal relations and best interests of the Indian child by assisting the child in establishing, developing, and maintaining political, cultural, and social relationships with the child's Indian tribe and Indian community; (§16001.9(a)(37)).

These provisions clearly recognize a strong beneficial relationship between an Indian child and the child's tribe even in delinquency cases. Section 676 (a) of the Welfare and Institutions Code¹

Unrecognized tribes

Section 306.6 of the Welfare and Institutions Code² permits the court to allow the tribe from which a child is descended to participate in a dependency proceeding involving a child who would otherwise be an Indian child but for the status of the child's tribe, including that the tribe is not federally recognized. Section 16001.9 of the Welfare and Institutions Code³, commonly referred to as the Foster Care Bill of Rights also provides protection to certain rights of children who identify as Native American even if their tribe is not federally recognized. These include the right:

1. To receive adequate clothing and grooming and hygiene products that respect the child's culture and ethnicity (§16001.9(a)(3));

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=WIC&division=2.&title=&part=1.&chapter=2.&article=17.

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=WIC§ionNum=306.6.

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=WIC§ionNum=16001.9.

¹ Available at:

² Available at:

³ Available at:

- 2. To be placed with a relative or nonrelative extended family member if an appropriate and willing individual is available (§16001.9(a)(5));
- 3. To attend religious services, activities, and ceremonies of the child's choice, including, but not limited to, engaging in traditional Native American religious practices (§16001.9(a)(15)); and
- 4. To participate in extracurricular, cultural, racial, ethnic, personal enrichment, and social activities (§16001.9(a)(16)).

Section 306.6 states that:

- (d) This section is intended to assist the court in making decisions that are in the best interest of the child by permitting a tribe in the circumstances set out in subdivision (a) to inform the court and parties to the proceeding about placement options for the child within the child's extended family or the tribal community, services and programs available to the child and the child's parents as Indians, and other unique interests the child or the child's parents may have as Indians. This section shall not be construed to make the Indian Child Welfare Act (25 U.S.C. Sec. 1901 et seq.), or any state law implementing the Indian Child Welfare Act, applicable to the proceedings, or to limit the court's discretion to permit other interested persons to participate in these or any other proceedings.
- (e) The court shall, on a case-by-case basis, make a determination if this section is applicable and may request information from the tribe, or the entity claiming to be a tribe, from which the child is descended for the purposes of making this determination, if the child would otherwise be an Indian child pursuant to subdivision (a).

Under section 306.6 (b), if the court permits the tribe to participate in the proceeding, then, with the consent of the court, the tribe may:

- 1. Be present at the hearing.
- 2. Address the court.
- 3. Request and receive notice of hearings.
- 4. Request to examine court documents relating to the proceeding.
- 5. Present information to the court that is relevant to the proceeding.
- 6. Submit written reports and recommendations to the court.
- 7. Perform other duties and responsibilities as requested or approved by the court.

Section 306.6 was enacted in 2006, prior to revisions to section 16001.9 in 2019 that added most of the provisions specifically relating to Indian and Native American children.⁴

Heritage Cases

Sometimes a child's parents are members of a tribe, but the child is not a member or eligible for membership. This can be because the tribe's membership rolls are closed, or because the child does not meet one or more of the tribe's specific membership criteria. These children may still live on tribal lands, be eligible for tribal services, and be considered members of the tribal community.

Under section 16001.9 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, these children also have protected rights to:

- 1. Receive adequate clothing and grooming and hygiene products that respect the child's culture and ethnicity (§16001.9(a)(3));
- 2. Be placed with a relative or nonrelative extended family member if an appropriate and willing individual is available (§16001.9(a)(5));
- 3. Attend religious services, activities, and ceremonies of the child's choice, including, but not limited to, engaging in traditional Native American religious practices (§16001.9(a)(15)); and
- 4. Participate in extracurricular, cultural, racial, ethnic, personal enrichment, and social activities (§16001.9(a)(16)).

Fulfillment of many of these rights can benefit from the participation of the tribe that the child and family are affiliated with, notwithstanding that the child does not meet the definition of Indian child under ICWA. Section 346 of the Welfare and Institutions Code⁵ permits the judicial officer presiding over a case to admit such persons as deemed to have a direct and legitimate interest in the case or work of the court.

The Proposal

This proposal responds to a concern identified by tribal advocates and leaders. It advances the Judicial Council's goals of access to justice. This proposal would provide guidance and ensure consistency in accordance with the statutes discussed above, in cases falling within these three categories where there is discretion to allow a tribe to participate in a juvenile case. Tribes, particularly unrecognized tribes, often have limited resources. They may participate in court via a tribal representative rather than an attorney. It can be challenging for tribal advocates to draft

https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=WIC&division=2.&title=&part=1.&chapter=2.&article=9.

⁴ See Assembly Bill No. 175, Stats 2019 Ch. 416 available at: https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill id=201920200AB175

⁵ Available at:

requests for orders without additional guidance. This proposal would set out clear consistent procedures to be followed and adopt forms to be used when a tribe wishes to participate in cases where there is no right of tribal participation under ICWA, but where the court has a discretion to permit tribal participation.

The proposal would amend California Rules of Court, rule 5.482 (d) which currently governs tribal intervention, to include three more subdivisions addressing tribal participation in the three situations discussed above. It would also amend rule 5.530 which governs the persons permitted to be present during juvenile proceedings by adding a subdivision (f) to clarify that discretionary tribal participation is governed by the new provisions in rule 5.482. The proposal would also adopt an optional form.

Alternatives Considered

The committees considered whether educational resources or job aids would be sufficient to address the issues raised by tribal leaders and advocates. Given the complexity of the legal issues and the importance of the interests and rights of tribal children and tribes that are at stake, the committees decided that rules and forms were the best way to protect those rights and interests and bring consistency to the exercise of discretion across courts.

Fiscal and Operational Impacts

The committees do not anticipate fiscal or operational impacts beyond the updating of systems to reflect to the new forms. By providing greater clarify and creating a process and form the committees believe that this proposal will ultimately reduce contested motions.

Request for Specific Comments

In addition to comments on the proposal as a whole, the advisory committees are interested in comments on the following:

Does the proposal appropriately address the stated purpose?

The advisory committees also seek comments from *courts* on the following cost and implementation matters:

- Would the proposal provide cost savings? If so, please quantify.
- What would the implementation requirements be for courts—for example, training staff (please identify position and expected hours of training), revising processes and procedures (please describe), changing docket codes in case management systems, or modifying case management systems?
- Would 3 months from Judicial Council approval of this proposal until its effective date provide sufficient time for implementation?
- How well would this proposal work in courts of different sizes?

Attachments and Links

- 1. Cal. Rules of Court, rules 5.482 and 5.530, at pages 7–8
- 2. Forms ICWA-042, at pages 9-10

Rules 5.482 and 5.530 of the California Rules of Court would be amended effective January 1, 2024, to read:

Rule 5.482. Proceedings after notice

2 3 (a) - (c) * * *

(d) Intervention and tribal participation

(1) When the Indian Child Welfare Act applies, Tthe Indian child's tribe and Indian custodian are entitled to intervene, orally or in writing, at any point in the proceedings. The tribe may, but is not required to, file with the court the Notice of Designation of Tribal Representative in a Court Proceeding Involving an Indian Child (form ICWA-040) and Tribal Intervention or Request to Participate in Proceedings Involving Tribal Child (form ICWA-042) to give notice of its intent to intervene.

(2) In cases involving an Indian child but where the Indian Child Welfare Act does not apply, the child's tribe may request permission to participate in the proceedings under section 346 or 676 of the Welfare and Institutions Code using the *Tribal Intervention or Request to Participate in Proceedings*Involving Tribal Child (form ICWA-042). Consistent with sections 224 and 16001.9 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, the request shall be approved absent a finding by the court that the tribe's participation would not assist the court in making decisions that are in the best interest of the child. Upon approval of a request, unless the court orders otherwise, the tribe shall have the right to:

a. Be present at the hearing;

b. Address the court;

c. Request and receive notice of hearings;

d. Request to examine court documents relating to the proceeding:

e. Present information to the court that is relevant to the proceeding;f. Submit written reports and recommendations to the court; and

g. Perform other duties and responsibilities as requested or approved by the court.

(3) In a proceeding involving a child described by section 306.6 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, the tribe from which the child is descended may request permission to participate in the proceedings using the *Tribal Intervention or Request to Participate in Proceedings Involving Tribal Child* (form ICWA-042). Consistent with sections 224 and 16001.9 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, the request shall be approved absent a finding by the court that the tribe's participation would not assist the court in making decisions that are in the best interest of the child. Upon approval, the tribe shall have the right to participate as described by section 306.6 of the Welfare and Institutions Code.

 Rules 5.482 and 5.530 of the California Rules of Court would be amended effective January 1, 2024, to read:

1 2 (4) When a child does not meet the definition of an Indian child but either of the 3 child's parents is a member of an Indian tribe and the tribe wishes to participate in juvenile proceedings involving the child, the tribe may request permission to 4 5 participate in the proceedings under section 346 or 676 of the Welfare and 6 Institutions Code as the case may be using the *Tribal Intervention or Request to* Participate in Proceedings Involving Tribal Child (form ICWA-042). 7 Consistent with sections 224 and 16001.9 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, 8 9 the request shall be approved absent a finding by the court that the tribe's 10 participation would not assist the court in making decisions that are in the best 11 interest of the child. 12 13 14 (e) - (g) * * *15 16 Rule 5.530. Persons present 17 (a) - (e) * * *18 19 20 Discretionary tribal participation (§§224, 306.6, 346, 676, 827, 16001.9) 21 22 When a proceeding not governed by the Indian Child Welfare Act involves an Indian child, a child descended from an Indian tribe, or a child described by section 23 306.6 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, a request by the child's tribe to 24 25 participate in the proceeding is governed by rule 5.482(d)(2)-(4).

ATTORNEY OR PARTY	WITHOUT ATTORNEY	STATE BAR NUMBER:		FOR COURT USE ONLY
NAME:				, on econ. eco en
FIRM NAME:				
STREET ADDRESS:				
CITY:		STATE: ZIP CODE	:	
TELEPHONE NO.: FAX NO.:			DRAFT	
E-MAIL ADDRESS:				
ATTORNEY FOR (name):				Not approved by
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF				the Judicial Council
STREET ADDRESS:	KI OF CALIFORNIA,	COUNTION		
MAILING ADDRESS:				
ICITY AND ZIP CODE:				
BRANCH NAME:				
CHILD'S NAME:				
				CASE NUMBER:
		ERVENTION OR REQUEST FOI		DELATED CASES (if any)
PARTICIPAT	ION IN A COUR	FPROCEEDING INVOLVING A	TRIBAL CHILD	RELATED CASES (if any):
TO ALL PARTIE	S:			
. •				
1. The (name of tribe):				is a federally recognized tribe
a tribe described by section 306.6 of the Welfare and Institutions Code.				
	•			
2. The above named child or children are <i>(select one):</i>				
a. Members of the tribe;				
b. Eligible for membership in the tribe and the biological child of a member; or				
c. Otherwise affiliated with the tribe and considered members of the tribal community.				
3. The tribe is (select one):				
a. formally intervening as a party as of right under 25 U.S.C. §1911(c) and California Rules of Court, rule 5.482(d)(a);				
 requesting leave to participate in the proceedings under Welf. & Inst Code section 346 or 676 and California Rules of Court. rule 5.482(d)(2); 				
c requesting leave to participate in the proceedings under Welf. & Inst Code section 306.6 and California Rules of Court. rule 5.482(d)(3).				
d. requesting leave to participate in the proceedings under Welf. & Inst Code section 346 or 676 and California Rules of				
Court. rule 5.482(d)(4).				
4. The tribe requests that notice of all proceedings be sent to:				
Name:				
Title:	-			
	-			
Address.	City	Stata		7in Cada.
	City,	State,		Zip Code:
Telephone:			Ema	Zip Code:ail:
I declare under	penalty of perjury u	nder the laws of the State of Californi	a that the foregoin	g and all attachments are true and correct.
·			ŭ	-
Date:				
			N.	
			•	
	(TYPE OR PRINT N	AME)	-	(SIGNATURE)